Architectural Conservancy of Ontario Advisory Board Appraisal of the 1905 Pumphouse, Waterworks Park, Grimsby, Ontario

Introduction

This report is in response to a request from the Grimsby LACAC for an independent examination of the structural condition of the building, to assist them in their decision whether to designate the building under the Ontario Heritage Act.

Anthony Butler, a member of the Advisory Board of the Architectural Conservancy of Ontario, visited the Pumphouse on 19 January 1991, accompanied for a short time by Dorothy Turcotte, Chairman of the Grimsby LACAC, and Wendy Watt and David Schultz of the Grimsby Historical Society. Hugh Flynn, the senior operator, who was on duty at the Pumphouse, provided helpful technical explanations and recollections.

Copies of old photographs of the Pumphouse and its site, historical information, and current information on the proposed redevelopment of the site were made available; information from these is incorporated in this report.

The objectives of the Advisory Board of the Architectural Conservancy of Ontario state, in part:

"The Board will respond to requests for appraisal from within the Conservancy and from outside... An appraisal should be duly undertaken by the Conservancy where it becomes aware of a significant property that is vulnerable.

"The Board will appraise built structures, their environment, and places of natural beauty in Ontario. A structure will be appraised for its architectural significance, physical condition and its role, if any, as part of a group of structures, a streetscape, a larger area, or its place in history...

"An appraisal will be general rather than exhaustive. A brief written report will be made which may include suggested uses for the property, structural modifications and necessary repairs, but detailed recommendations respecting design or structure will not be given..."

1. Historical Evaluation

1.1 General Historical Context

The building is representative of an early 20th ·century brick waterworks facility. It has been in continuous use since its construction in 1905. The building is located on one of the few remaining publicly accessible parts of the lakeshore in Grimsby, adjacent to the mouth of forty Mile Creek.

1.2 Architectural Historical Context

Although it has lost some of its original architectural features, the building is a good example of municipal buildings of its period. Examination of early photographs of the building shows the sloping portions of the roof were originally faced with standing-seam metal roofing, with a cast or wrought iron cresting around the perimeter of the flat central portion of the roof. The cresting is no longer in place, and the roofing material is now asphalt shingles, which were replaced about three years ago (photograph 1).

The principal (south) elevation of the building (photograph 2) shows an asymmetrical composition of Romanesque character. Internal and external evidence indicates that the building was probably constructed in three stages, although these were probably close together in time, as the brick masonry is very consistent and uniform in quality. The facade is d4vided into three unequal sections, separated by shallow brick pilasters. The earliest, western, section of the building is slightly less than half the total length (photograph 3). This part of the elevation is a pleasantly proportioned composition, with a central entrance with semi-circular fanlight above, flanked by two niches containing marble panels commemorating the construction of the building and waterworks system, and the members of the Municipal Council responsible for the project (photographs 4 and 5). A slightly projecting brick string course at the spring line of the round arches connects the plaques and the central entrance together and outlines each arch. The top of the wall is finished with a row of brick brackets below the wood cornice.

L

The second and third sections of the building are equal to each other in. width, but narrower than the first section (photograph 1). The center bay contains a window, with a semi-circular fanlight matching that over the entrance door in the first section. A detailed photograph of the junction between the first and second sections (photograph 6) clearly shows the construction joint beside the pilaster which formed the original corner of the first section of the building. A similar joint is visible on the north wall of the original building (photographs 7 and 8); this wall is now inside the rear extension of the structure and has therefore been painted. Note that the mason misaligned the string course on this side of the building. In the interior of the main building, brick piers define the east end of the first section of the building (photograph 9); it is not clear from the construction of these piers whether there was originally a wall at this point. The east end of the second section is enclosed by a brick wall, which probably contained two windows; the outline of the brick arches for these windows can still be seen above the bricked-up openings. A single door leading into the easternmost section of the building was constructed at a later date (photograph 10).

The easternmost section of the building is also separated from the adjacent construction and has moved away from it, leaving a large tapered crack which has subsequently been filled by conspicuous cement patching (photograph 11). The south side of this section originally contained a pair of doors, .similar to those at the west end of the building, but has now been blocked up, leaving a single entrance into the office. This part of the building is divided into two small rooms. Both rooms are lighted by windows with fanlights above, which may have been relocated from the east wall of the second section, since they are identical to the window in the south side of that section. The east elevation (photograph 12) maintains the detailing and pleasant proportions of the main elevation. The two interior offices are separated by a brick wall, where evidence of movement can again be seen at the junction with the east wall of the second section (photograph 13).

The interior of the main Pump Room also shows evidence of having been constructed in two stages. The pressed metal ceiling panels in the two sections are different (photographs 14 and 15); a third type of pressed metal was discovered above the suspended ceiling in the easternmost section of the building (photograph 16). The north (photograph 17) and west (photograph 18) walls of the main pump room contain doors and windows, complete with their original fanlights, which must have been exterior walls when the building was first constructed.

A large lean-to structure on the rear of the building (photograph 19) contains a settling tank and several large holding tanks (photograph 20).

1.3 **Special Historical Events**

The site is the location of the Battle of the Forty, which took place on 8 June 1813, two days after the defeat of the Americans by the British at Stoney Creek. A historical plaque (photograph 21) commemorates the event.

2. Environment or Cultural Context

2.1 Cultural Context

The construction of the waterworks in Grimsby at the beginning of the 20th Century was obviously significant in the history of the community. Early photographs indicate that the building was an important civic monument, surrounded by carefully landscaped grounds.

2.2 Urban Context

As noted earlier, the Pumphouse is located on one of the few portions of publicly accessible lakeshore in Grimsby. The grounds around the Pumphouse were extensively landscaped, with the bank to its west having a rock garden topped by a summer house or bandstand. None of the original landscaping now remains.

3. Technical Evaluation

Except for the settlement in the easternmost section of the building, there is no evidence of structural deterioration. No cracks are visible in the brick masonry walls, not even in the walls of the easternmost section, despite the settlement which has occurred. Except for one entrance, the original doors and windows, complete with their fanlights, still exist; windows and fanlights in the north wall of the original building are still in place, except one fanlight, which has been removed (photograph 22).

Despite the considerable movement which occurred in the easternmost section of the building, there is little evidence of its continuation after the crack was patched (photograph 11).

The building has been well maintained, with little significant alteration since it was originally constructed.

Although a small grassed area still exists in front of the building, the character of its original setting has been lost.

4. Conclusions and Recommendations

The Grimsby Pumphouse is a good example of a typical municipal engineering structure from the early 20th Century. Despite changes in its setting, the building itself remains almost unchanged from the time of its original construction; the changed elements could be restored or replaced at relatively minor cost

The building appears to be in sound structural condition. There is no evidence of any structural failure, except for settlement of the easternmost section of the building, which appears to have stabilized. The rear lean-to section of the building does not enhance the structure; its removal should be considered, once the Pumphouse is no longer required for its original purpose.

The structural condition of the building should not be considered a negative factor in any decision to designate or not to designate the building.

If a decision to designate and retain the building is made, the following recommendations should be followed:

- 1. Examine the patching of the settlement crack in the south and north walls of the main building, to determine whether a less unsightly method of closing the gap could be installed.
- 2. Remove infill from east entrance and reinstate a pair of doors with fanlight above, to match west entrance.
- 3. When asphalt shingles require replacement, reinstate standing seam metal roofing with cast iron cresting, as shown in early photographs.
- 4. Consider removal of rear lean-to section of the building, to expose original north wall of main block. When this is done,
 - .1 Remove paint from original masonry (do not use an abrasive method such as sand blasting).
 - .2 Reinstate missing fanlight to east window.
 - .3 Reinstate missing pair of doors from central entrance.
- 5. Improve setting of building by reconstructing former Municipal Park, incorporating historic plaque.
- 6. Engage a qualified restoration Architect to carry out detailed evaluation of historical records and the building itself, and to specify required restoration work.



Exterior from south



Exterior from Southeast



3. exterior, south elevation of west section



4. west plaque

GRIMSBY WATER WORKS PUMPING STATION

ERECTED A.O. 1905

COST OF WATER WORKS SYSTEM \$40,000

WILLIS CHIPMAN CHIEF ENGINEER



5. east plaque

MEMBERS OF MUNICIPAL COUNCIL

REEVE WM MITCHELL

COUNCILLORS ARTHUR BURLAND WM J. DROPE B.A. HENRY H. MARSH JAS. S. MORRIS M.D.

> CLERK JAS. BRODIE

6. Image Exterior South wall pilaster, showing construction joint





7. Interior, north wall of building, showing misaligned string course



8. Interior, north wall of main building, showing construction joint



- 9. Interior looking east
- 10. Interior showing brick pier between west and center section





11. Exterior, north wall showing settlement crack

12. Exterior, east side





13. interior, center wall in east section, showing settlement crack



14. ceiling of west section



15. ceiling of center section



16. ceiling of east section, above suspended ceiling



17. Interior, looking northwest



18. Interior looking west



19. Interior, rear addition, west side

20. Exterior, rear addition, west side





21. historic plaque "Engagement at the Forty"



22. interior, north wall of main building